## PHYSIOLOGY 38: 000-000, 2023, Eirst pub

PHYSIOLOGY 38: 000–000, 2023. First published November 1, 2022; doi:10.1152/physiol.00022.2022

### **REVIEW**

# Effects of Developmental Hypoxia on the Vertebrate Cardiovascular System

Developmental hypoxia has profound and persistent effects on the vertebrate cardiovascular system, but the nature, magnitude, and long-term outcome of the hypoxic consequences are species specific. Here we aim to identify common and novel cardiovascular responses among vertebrates that encounter developmental hypoxia, and we discuss the possible medical and ecological implications.

### Gina L. J. Galli,<sup>1</sup> Mitchell C. Lock,<sup>1</sup> Kerri L. M. Smith,<sup>1</sup> Dino A. Giussani,<sup>2</sup> and Dane A. Crossley 2nd<sup>3</sup>

<sup>1</sup>Faculty of Biology, Medicine and Health, University of Manchester, Manchester, United Kingdom; <sup>2</sup>Department of Physiology, Development and Neuroscience, University of Cambridge, Cambridge, United Kingdom; and <sup>3</sup>Department of Biological Sciences, University of North Texas, Denton, Texas gina.galli@manchester.ac.uk

### embryo; fetus; heart; hypoxia; programming

### Introduction

An organism is most sensitive to its environment during early development. Even minor changes in temperature, oxygen, or pH can lead to adaptive responses that can alter embryonic and fetal morphology and physiology (1). If the environmental stress occurs during critical developmental periods, the phenotypic changes are often permanent and persist into adulthood (2). Epigenetic changes in gene expression may also be triggered, which means that the environment during development can program traits that are heritable (3, 4). Furthermore, adverse conditions during development may influence the reproductive capacity of offspring (5). Therefore, environmental fluctuations during early life can have profound and persistent effects on organismal structure, function, and behavior across generations.

Insufficient oxygen supply (hypoxia) is one of the most pervasive and disruptive environmental stressors during embryonic and fetal development (6-9). For mammals, oxygen levels within the womb are tightly regulated to normal values at  $\sim$ 25 mmHg. This level of oxygen is considerably lower than arterial values in adulthood (~100 mmHg), but it is sufficient for fetal tissue requirements and it promotes healthy fetal and placental development (10, 11). However, human fetal arterial  $PO_2$  ( $Pa_{O_2}$ ) can sometimes be halved to 12 mmHg [equivalent to the mother breathing 10% oxygen saturation  $(%O_2)$ ] during pregnancy complications, such as in placental insufficiency, preeclampsia, gestational diabetes, and even maternal obesity, which lead to detrimental outcomes (12). In contrast to mammals, many birds and oviparous ectothermic vertebrates (fish, amphibians, and reptiles) develop with little or no parental care and are often exposed to wide fluctuations in oxygen. For example, embryonic birds can experience hypoxia at 12-16%O2 (13) due to nesting behaviors in mounds, burrows, or alpine regions (13-20), and embryonic reptiles can be exposed to oxygen tensions ranging between  $10\%O_2$  and  $21\%O_2$ (21, 22). But possibly the most severe levels of hypoxia are found in the habitats of embryonic and larval fish, where some species develop in lakes and ponds with < $1\%O_2$  (23). At the extreme, these environments may become completely devoid of oxygen (anoxia) (24). Thus, there is no "normal" oxygen concentration for most embryonic birds and ectothermic vertebrates. Given these constraints, natural selection is likely to have favored the evolution of traits that protect avian and ectotherm embryos from hypoxia.

The vertebrate cardiovascular system is particularly sensitive to developmental hypoxia, as it is the first line of defense against oxygen deprivation. In mammals, the lack of oxygen causes fetal cardiovascular adjustments that permanently remodel the heart and program disease susceptibility in adulthood (12, 25, 26). Embryonic birds share many of the cardiovascular responses to developmental hypoxia with fetal mammals (8, 27), but far less is known about ectothermic vertebrates. Importantly, there are major differences in metabolism and cardiovascular physiology between vertebrates. First, the metabolic rate of embryonic ectothermic vertebrates is much lower than that of endotherms, and, similar to that of bird embryos, it will vary according to the temperature of the environment. Whereas developmental temperature in mammals is set at a narrow range of 37-39°C, it can vary from 31°C to 39°C in birds (13), from 27°C to 38°C in reptiles (13), and from subzero to 43°C in fish (28, 29). Second, cardiovascular design varies dramatically among the vertebrate classes; fish have a single circulation with a two-chambered heart, most reptiles and amphibians have a dual circulation with a three-chambered undivided heart, and all crocodilians, birds, and mammals have a dual circulation with a completely divided four-chambered heart (30). It is likely that all of these factors will play a role in dictating the vertebrate response to hypoxia.

Given the widespread occurrence of developmental hypoxia across diverse habitats and vertebrate



species, a comparative analysis of vertebrate responses to developmental hypoxia will contribute knowledge toward a broad range of issues. From a clinical and physiological perspective, comparing the responses between viviparous and oviparous animals allows us to separate the direct effects of developmental hypoxia without the additional influences from the maternal and/or placental physiology (reviewed in Ref. 8). From a physiological and ecological perspective, comparing the limits of vertebrate developmental plasticity may help to predict species dynamics due to climate change. Therefore, the aim of this review is to provide a platform for a comparative discussion of the phenotypic consequences of developmental hypoxia on the vertebrate cardiovascular system. We do not discuss the numerous and diverse responses to developmental hypoxia in each vertebrate species, as this is beyond the scope of this focused review. Rather, we aim to identify common and novel cardiovascular phenotypic signatures among vertebrates as a consequence of developmental hypoxia and discuss possible implications.

### Embryonic and Fetal Cardiovascular Responses to Hypoxia in Vertebrates

Embryonic and fetal vertebrates have three main options to acclimate to hypoxia: increase oxygen extraction, decrease oxygen consumption, and/or increase the efficiency of oxygen utilization (12). The overall response is unique to each species and highly dependent on the timing, severity, nature, and duration of the hypoxic insult, which mediates broad changes in cardiovascular structure and function (25). Nevertheless, some common signatures have emerged.

### Modulation of Heart Rate

Most embryonic and fetal vertebrates respond to acute hypoxia (minutes) with a reduction in heart rate (32). This response is thought to lower the metabolic demand of the heart, leading to reduced myocardial oxygen consumption (12). However, it should be noted that Fisher et al. (33) found no change in fetal cardiac oxygen consumption after 15 min of acute hypoxia (descending aortic Po2 at 14 mmHg), despite a 20% reduction in heart rate. Whether fetal cardiac oxygen consumption decreases immediately after the onset of acute hypoxia, when the fetal heart rate is at its nadir, or during greater levels of fetal hypoxia has not yet been investigated. The hypoxic bradycardia also serves to increase myocardial contractility and maintain cardiac output through the Frank-Starling mechanism, by prolonging end-diastolic filling time and thereby end-diastolic volume (34). In birds, reptiles, and fish, the bradycardia may not be evident in early incubation or with mild levels of acute hypoxia, but a

reduction in heart rate is consistently observed in the latter 70% of incubation (35-39). However, in situations where developmental hypoxia becomes chronic (days to months), the initial bradycardia recovers in mammals and birds, and heart rate remains at control levels (40-43). In contrast, American alligators exposed to  $\leq 10\%O_2$  at 10–90% development maintain bradycardia throughout (44-46), and the same conditions either cause no change (6, 44, 47) or significant tachycardia (48-50) in snapping turtles and scincid lizard heart rate. Tachycardia is also the common response in embryonic and larval zebrafish exposed to mild levels of chronic hypoxia, but this develops into a bradycardia when the level of hypoxia is more severe ( $<5\%O_2$ ) (51–53). Thus, in contrast to endothermic vertebrates, modulation of heart rate in ectothermic vertebrates appears to be an important mechanism to control cardiac output during extended periods of developmental hypoxia.

### Vascularization and Oxygen Carrying Capacity

Under normal conditions, oxygen extraction in most embryonic and fetal vertebrates is extremely efficient because of the expression of functionally distinct highaffinity hemoglobin isoforms (54). Nevertheless, reductions in oxygen saturation of the arterial blood can trigger adaptations that improve oxygen carrying capacity and delivery. For example, hypoxia leads to an increased expression of embryonic hemoglobin in fish (55) and a stimulation of hematopoiesis in most birds (56), fish (57), reptiles (58, 59), and mammals (60, 61). Hypoxia is also a major stimulator of angiogenesis in the chorioallantoic membrane of fish (62), reptiles (63), and birds (56), which serves to improve oxygen extraction at the site of gas exchange. Similarly, in mammals, early-onset gestational hypoxia remodels the placenta (64), increasing placental volume and the fetal capillary surface area (65).

# The Brain-Sparing Effect and Asymmetric Growth Restriction

The well-established "brain-sparing" circulatory response is another common phenotypic signature in fetal mammals, designed to support vital tissues at the expense of less important organs (32). In this response, acute hypoxia triggers differential vasomotion, consisting of constriction in the vasculature of peripheral organs, such as the hindlimbs, and vasodilatation in hypoxiasensitive organs, such as the brain. Consequently, the fetal cardiac output is redistributed to maintain perfusion of the developing central nervous system with adequate levels of oxygen and other nutrients (32, 34, 66). Although protective in the short term, sustained fetal brain sparing can result in asymmetric growth restriction where fetal mammals including primates conserve head size at the expense of body length or they are thin for their length (67). The redistribution of blood flow favoring the brain has also been demonstrated in the chicken embryo in the second half of incubation (68), and there is an apparent increase in brain blood flow in hypoxic snapping turtles from 70% of incubation (69). Numerous studies have shown that chronic hypoxia also causes growth restriction in embryonic fish, reptiles, and birds (6, 39-41, 44-46, 58, 70-85). Importantly, whereas chronic hypoxia reduces embryonic body mass and body length in American alligators, snapping turtles, Florida red-bellied turtles, and leopard geckos, the total incubation time is unchanged (6, 40, 44-46, 58, 70, 76, 77, 82, 86). Similarly, some models of chronic hypoxic pregnancy in rats do not reduce gestational length (87), but lambs from hypoxic pregnancies tend to be born a few days earlier (88).

Similar to mammals, birds, and reptiles, hypoxia leads to slower tissue growth rates (51, 89-92) and growth retardation (57, 89, 93-99) in fish. However, fish may represent an outlier with respect to the embryonic/fetal brain-sparing effect. To our knowledge, there is no evidence of asymmetric growth restriction in fish, and recent in vivo imaging of zebrafish larvae chronically exposed to hypoxia [8%O<sub>2</sub> from 1 to 15 days postfertilization (dpf)] has shown that brain blood flow is unchanged (57), despite a redistribution of blood flow. Instead, it appears that blood flow is driven from the zebrafish gut to the so-called red layer of muscle, which has been implicated in the uptake of oxygen in early larvae (100). Therefore, oxygen extraction may be the priority in hypoxic zebrafish larvae. Nevertheless, it is also possible that the reflex cardiovascular responses required for the brain-sparing effect may only exist in the latter stages of zebrafish development, after 15 dpf. Interestingly, in contrast to the human or sheep, fetal animals of highland species, such as the llama, show no increase in brain blood flow during acute hypoxia (101), with no increase in oxygen extraction across the brain (102). Instead, there is a fall in fetal brain O<sub>2</sub> consumption and temperature, together with a decrease in the activity of Na<sup>+</sup>-K<sup>+</sup>-ATPase and in Na<sup>+</sup> channel expression, which serves to reduce metabolic demand and protect against seizures and neuronal death (103).

### Cardiac Enlargement or Sparing

In addition to asymmetric growth restriction, the sustained vasoconstriction and redistribution of blood flow associated with embryonic/fetal brain sparing can cause systemic hypertension (60, 104). The resulting increase in cardiac afterload can trigger cardiac enlargement, which is sometimes observed in fetal rats and sheep (105, 106). More commonly, mammalian fetal heart mass is unchanged during chronic hypoxia ("spared") and body weight is reduced, leading

to an increase in the heart-to-body weight ratio (25, 61, 105-109). This latter phenotype is also the dominant response in chronically hypoxic embryos from chickens, American alligators, snapping turtles, and Florida red-bellied turtles (37, 45, 58, 71, 86, 110). However, cardiac hypertrophy has been reported in the lizard gecko and the snapping turtle late in development (45, 77), and some studies have even found thinning of the ventricular wall in chickens (72, 111, 112). In embryonic zebrafish, chronic hypoxia initially causes a reduction in heart size, but cardiac hypertrophy occurs once they reach the larval stages (62, 113-115). It is not clear why these studies have such discrepancies between species and vertebrate classes, and there seems to be no clear correlation between the response and experimental variables such as species, stage of development, and/or the severity of the hypoxic exposure. Interestingly, Crossley's group identified specific stages of development in which reptiles were particularly sensitive to hypoxia (e.g., critical windows) and showed that cardiac enlargement in alligators and turtles precedes, and is distinct from, the critical window for somatic growth restriction. This suggests that, at least in reptiles, embryonic cardiac hypertrophy is a targeted and direct response to hypoxia, rather than an indirect outcome of reduced somatic growth (43, 46).

### Adrenergic Sensitivity

Sensitization of the sympathoadrenal medullary system is another hallmark of the vertebrate response to developmental hypoxia. First, basal levels of plasma norepinephrine and/or epinephrine are increased in hypoxic fetal sheep (116-119), fetal llamas (102), embryonic chickens (120-122), and embryonic alligators (41). The density, expression, and sensitivity of *B*-adrenergic receptors are also enhanced by hypoxia in embryonic chickens (73, 123), as well as enhanced sympathetic innervation in the peripheral vasculature (122). The mammalian fetal peripheral vasoconstrictor response to hypoxia, part of the fetal brainsparing response and triggered by sympathetic activation, is also markedly sensitized by chronic hypoxia (117) and is greatly increased in the llama fetus relative to fetal sheep (101–103). Similarly, chronic hypoxia increases gene expression of  $\beta$ -adrenergic receptors in larval zebrafish (53) and increases cardiac responsiveness to adrenergic agonists in rainbow trout, as well as delaying the onset of cholinergic control (91). The sensitization of the sympathoadrenal medullary system by developmental hypoxia serves to increase oxygen delivery by raising cardiac output and also contributes to the brain-sparing effect through enhanced peripheral vasoconstriction. However, sustained sensitization can be detrimental and lead to cardiac and vascular remodeling and dysfunction, increasing cardiovascular risk in later life (12).

# Mitochondrial Remodeling and Oxidative Stress

During normal development in mammals, a metabolic shift from anaerobic to aerobic respiration occurs during mid to late gestation and the heart relies predominantly on mitochondria for the majority of ATP production (124). Hypoxia is expected to reduce ATP production and increase reactive oxygen species (ROS) production, which can lead to mitochondrial remodeling (125). Indeed, early- and late-onset gestational hypoxia has been reported to decrease fetal cardiac mitochondrial protein expression and activity of electron transport chain complexes, increase ROS and markers of oxidative stress, reduce mitochondrial DNA copy number, and decrease mitochondrial respiration (126-128). Interestingly, the phenotype in all these studies was sex dependent and either absent in females or more pronounced in males. In contrast, the avian mitochondrial phenotype response to hypoxia is much milder, with one study finding no effects of hypoxia on chicken embryonic mitochondrial ROS production and respiration (apart from a mild decrease in complex IV) (129) and another finding an increase in mitochondrion-derived oxidative stress, together with a reduction in mitochondrial efficiency (130). To our knowledge, only one study has been performed on embryonic ectothermic mitochondria, which showed that hypoxia had no effects on alligator mitochondrial respiration or efficiency (131).

# Effects of Developmental Hypoxia on the Adult Cardiovascular System

The seminal work from David Barker in the 1980s showed that intrauterine stressors could increase cardiovascular disease susceptibility in adulthood (132), a phenomenon known as developmental programming. Since then, there has been extensive research into the long-term effects of developmental hypoxia on cardiovascular health and disease. This section reviews the cardiovascular phenotype of vertebrates that were exposed to developmental hypoxia and subsequently maintained in normoxia until adulthood.

### Long-Term Outcome in Birds and Mammals

It is now well established from epidemiological and laboratory studies that mammalian pregnancies complicated by hypoxia increase the incidence and likelihood of cardiovascular dysfunction and disease in adulthood (12, 133–136). After birth, the growth-restricted neonate continues to develop ex utero in a process called "catch-up growth" allowing for the rapid development of organs that were sacrificed in utero (137). Although necessary, the accelerated growth causes problems of its own and has been linked to programmed disease (138) The most

common attributes of the cardiovascular phenotype of adult offspring from hypoxic pregnancies include cardiac hypertrophy, enhanced myocardial contractility, hypertension, endothelial dysfunction, thickening of the aortic wall, sympathetic dominance, mitochondrial abnormalities, and diastolic dysfunction (reviewed in Ref. 12). Many of these problems are carried forward from the hypoxic pregnancy, whereas others appear to develop with aging, and, similar to the embryonic phenotype, females are usually less affected than males. Although the cardiac phenotype is not always overt, it is important from a clinical perspective because it appears to sensitize the adult heart to disease stimuli, such as ischemia-reperfusion injury (109, 139-141). Indeed, recent clinical work has shown a higher incidence of many cardiovascular diseases in offspring from pregnancies associated with hypoxia, such as placental insufficiency, fetal growth restriction, and preeclampsia (133, 134, 136). These studies suggest that developmental hypoxia is an independent risk factor for cardiovascular disease, and studies are now underway to develop maternal therapies to prevent cardiovascular programming (12).

Unfortunately, far fewer studies have determined the long-term impact of developmental hypoxia on the adult avian cardiovascular system, but there are clearly many similarities with the mammalian phenotype. For example, sex-dependent pulmonary hypertension and right heart dysfunction were found in adult chickens raised from eggs incubated at high altitude, and this was associated with hypotension and lower systolic and diastolic arterial pressures (107, 142). Some studies have also found cardiac hypertrophy in adult chickens from hypoxic incubations (142), whereas others have not (71, 73), and there have also been reports of reduced contractility, extended relaxation times, myocardial fibrosis, systemic hypertension, decreased  $\beta$ -adrenergic sensitivity, and altered baroreflex sensitivity (107, 123, 143). Variations in the cardiovascular outcome of developmental hypoxia between studies are likely dependent on the specific experimental conditions, but these studies highlight the similarities between chickens and mammals in the cardiovascular responses and the programming of heart disease. Therefore, the chicken embryo continues to be a useful model for assessing the consequences of chronic developmental hypoxia in isolation, and it confirms that developmental programming of heart disease is not solely dependent on maternal and/or placental factors.

### Long-Term Outcome in Reptiles

There are many similarities in the cardiovascular phenotype of reptiles and mammals subjected to hypoxia during development. For example, juvenile reptiles (1– 3 yr) from hypoxic incubations have an increased heart-to-body mass ratio, sympathetic dominance, and greater left ventricle stroke volume (76, 144–146). The increase in cardiac performance and adrenergic tone allows American alligators from hypoxic incubations to maintain higher aortic and carotid blood flows during swimming compared with their normoxic counterparts (144). Interestingly, the hypoxic alligators also had a decreased ratio of right ventricle to left ventricle mass (76), which is similar to adult mammalian offspring from hypoxic pregnancies and may reflect a sustained pulmonary hypertension (147, 148). Juvenile snapping turtles from hypoxic incubations also have increased stroke volume and cardiac output, but this is achieved by a different mechanism, since they have lower heart rates and a normal heart-to-body mass ratio (149). Similar to alligators, 5-yr-old turtles from hypoxic incubations have increased systemic blood flow (149). Nevertheless, in contrast to mammals, reptiles from hypoxic incubations do not show signs of diastolic dysfunction and, in fact, exhibit faster rates of ventricular relaxation (127). Another difference from mammals is that alligator hatchlings do not exhibit catch-up growth after hypoxia and instead remain growth restricted into adulthood (76, 144-146).

Some studies suggest that developmental hypoxia in reptiles can program greater hypoxia resistance later in life (145, 150). For example, exposure to developmental hypoxia blunts the cardiovascular response to acute hypoxia (4%O<sub>2</sub> for 20 min) in alligators (145)

and allows juvenile snapping turtles to maintain cardiac output twofold higher than control animals during 2 h of anoxia (150). The improved anoxia tolerance in snapping turtles was supported by an increased myofilament calcium sensitivity (151), a superior ability to suppress cardiac myocyte ROS production during anoxia (151), and lower basal mitochondrial ROS production (152). This latter finding may have important physiological and ecological implications, because limiting ROS production during hypoxia will reduce the likelihood of oxidative stress damage, which could be especially important for freshwater turtles that regularly encounter anoxia during breath-hold dives and when they are overwintering under ice-covered lakes. Similar adaptive responses have also been observed in adult American alligators after developmental hypoxia, where hypoxic cohorts have enhanced mitochondrial efficiency through a reduction in proton leak respiration (131).

### Long-Term Outcome in Fish

The cardiovascular phenotype of juvenile and adult fish from hypoxic incubations is very poorly studied. Some fish exposed to developmental hypoxia exhibit catch-up growth (99, 153, 154), whereas others do not (93, 155), but to our knowledge there is nothing known about cardiac structure or function. There is evidence that developmental hypoxia alters cardiac gene expression in rainbow trout, which could



#### FIGURE 1. Summary of effects of chronic developmental hypoxia (ranging between days and months) on the cardiovascular system during fetal and postnatal life across species

Downward- and upward-facing arrows represent a decrease or increase in the factors, respectfully. A tilde represents contrasting evidence within the literature, and question marks represent a currently unknown response to developmental hypoxia. Image created with BioRender.com, with permission. have implications for contractile function (154), and critical swimming speed is reduced (154). However, another study found negligible effects of developmental hypoxia on aerobic scope in Atlantic salmon (156). In contrast to reptiles, some fish that are raised in hypoxia show a reduced hypoxia tolerance as juveniles (99, 153). Clearly, more studies are necessary to fully determine the long-term impact of embryonic hypoxia exposure on fish cardiovascular function and fitness.

### **Perspectives**

Despite the profound differences in developmental morphology and physiology among vertebrates, there are remarkable similarities in the cardiovascular responses to chronic developmental hypoxia (FIGURE 1). These similarities are even more impressive when one considers the differences between studies in experimental variables, such as species, body temperature, severity of hypoxia, and physiological status (e.g., carbon dioxide levels and metabolism). This suggests that the main cardiovascular responses to developmental hypoxia have ancient origins and have been well conserved throughout vertebrate evolution. However, these compensatory responses early in life may claim trade-offs later in life. In mammals and birds, developmental hypoxia is associated with cardiovascular dysfunction and increased susceptibility to ischemia-reperfusion injury. The clinical implication for humans is that chronic developmental hypoxia should be recognized as an independent risk factor for offspring cardiovascular disease. In contrast, although reptiles and fish that experienced hypoxia during development share some common traits with mammals in adulthood, there are no overt signs of cardiovascular disease, and some species may even have enhanced stress tolerance. The reasons for the differential adaptation to developmental hypoxia in vertebrate endotherms compared with some vertebrate ectotherms are not clear. It is possible that ectothermic vertebrates elicit compensatory responses to hypoxia during development that do not claim adverse consequences at hatching. These alternative compensatory responses may include actions that lower metabolic demand, such as the neuronal hypometabolism reported in the llama fetus. Nevertheless, even if disease does not manifest, changes in the cardiovascular phenotype of ectotherms in response to developmental hypoxia can impact survival by altering fitnessrelated behaviors, such as mate selection and predator-prey interactions. Future research in this field may consider designing experiments that isolate the beneficial effects of developmental hypoxia on cardiovascular health from detrimental effects, as well as measuring fitness-related traits such as fecundity and mortality. It is also important to define the threshold level and duration of developmental hypoxia that elicits changes in the vertebrate cardiovascular system, as this will help to predict clinical outcomes and the effects of climatic disturbances. Finally, more work needs to be done to understand the synergistic effects of developmental hypoxia and other environmental factors that often occur simultaneously, such as hypercapnia and acidosis. Taking this kind of integrative approach is critical for predicting and mitigating the effects of climate change on the developmental plasticity of birds and ectothermic vertebrates.

No conflicts of interest, financial or otherwise, are declared by the authors.

M.C.L. prepared figures; G.L.J.G. drafted manuscript; G.L.J.G., M.C.L., K.L.M.S., D.A.G., and D.A.C. edited and revised manuscript; G.L.J.G., M.C.L., K.L.M.S., D.A.G., and D.A.C. approved final version of manuscript.

#### References

- West-Eberhard M. Developmental Plasticity and Evolution. Cambridge, MA: Oxford University Press, 2003.
- Fowden AL, Giussani DA, Forhead AJ. Intrauterine programming of physiological systems: causes and consequences. *Physiology* (*Bethesda*) 21: 29–37, 2006. doi:10.1152/physiol.00050.2005.
- Burggren WW, Mueller CA. Developmental critical windows and sensitive periods as three-dimensional constructs in time and space. *Physiol Biochem Zool* 88: 91–102, 2015. doi:10.1086/ 679906.
- Sales VM, Ferguson-Smith AC, Patti ME. Epigenetic mechanisms of transmission of metabolic disease across generations. *Cell Metab* 25: 559–571, 2017. doi:10.1016/j.cmet.2017.02.016.
- Aiken CE, Tarry-Adkins JL, Spiroski AM, Nuzzo AM, Ashmore TJ, Rolfo A, Sutherland MJ, Camm EJ, Giussani DA, Ozanne SE. Chronic gestational hypoxia accelerates ovarian aging and lowers ovarian reserve in next-generation adult rats. *FASEB J* 33: 7758–7766, 2019. doi:10.1096/fj.201802772R.
- Eme J, Rhen T, Tate KB, Gruchalla K, Kohl ZF, Slay CE, Crossley DA 2nd. Plasticity of cardiovascular function in snapping turtle embryos (*Chelydra serpentina*): chronic hypoxia alters autonomic regulation and gene expression. *Am J Physiol Regul Integr Comp Physiol* 304: R966–R979, 2013. doi:10.1152/ajpregu. 00595.2012.
- Hutter D, Kingdom J, Jaeggi E. Causes and mechanisms of intrauterine hypoxia and its impact on the fetal cardiovascular system: a review. *Int J Pediatr* 2010: 401323, 2010. doi:10.1155/2010/ 401323.
- Itani N, Salinas CE, Villena M, Skeffington KL, Beck C, Villamor E, Blanco CE, Giussani DA. The highs and lows of programmed cardiovascular disease by developmental hypoxia: studies in the chicken embryo. J Physiol 596: 2991–3006, 2018. doi:10.1113/ JP274111.
- Wu RS. Chapter 3. Effects of hypoxia on fish reproduction and development. In: *Fish Physiology*, edited by Richards JG, Farrell AP, Brauner CJ. London: Academic Press, 2009, p. 79–141.
- Battaglia F, Meschia G. Principal substrates of fetal metabolism. *Physiol Rev* 58: 499–527, 1978. doi:10.1152/physrev.1978.58. 2.499.
- Burton GJ, Cindrova-Davies T, Yung HW, Jauniaux E. Hypoxia and reproductive health: oxygen and development of the human placenta. *Reproduction* 161: F53–F65, 2021. doi:10.1530/REP-20-0153.
- Giussani DA. Breath of life: heart disease link to developmental hypoxia. *Circulation* 144: 1429–1443, 2021. doi:10.1161/ CIRCULATIONAHA.121.054689.
- Seymour RS, Ackerman RA. Adaptations to underground nesting in birds and reptiles. *Am Zool* 20: 437–447, 1980. doi:10.1093/ icb/20.2.437.

- Andrewartha SJ, Tazawa H, Burggren WW. Embryonic control of heart rate: examining developmental patterns and temperature and oxygenation influences using embryonic avian models. *Respir Physiol Neurobiol* 178: 84–96, 2011. doi:10.1016/j. resp.2011.04.014.
- Batbayar N, Takekawa JY, Natsagdorj T, Spragens KA, Xiao X. Site selection and nest survival of the barheaded goose (*Anser indicus*) on the Mongolian Plateau. *Waterbirds* 37: 381–393, 2014. doi:10.1675/ 063.037.0405.
- Birchard GF, Kilgore DL Jr, Boggs DF. Respiratory gas concentrations and temperatures within the burrows of three species of burrow-nesting birds. *Wilson Bull* 96: 451–456, 1984.
- Black CP, Tenney S. Oxygen transport during progressive hypoxia in high-altitude and sea-level waterfowl. *Respir Physiol* 39: 217–239, 1980. doi:10. 1016/0034-5687(80)90046-8.
- Hawkes LA, Balachandran S, Batbayar N, Butler PJ, Chua B, Douglas DC, Frappell PB, Hou Y, Milsom WK, Newman SH, Prosser DJ, Sathiyaselvam P, Scott GR, Takekawa JY, Natsagdorj T, Wikelski M, Witt MJ, Yan B, Bishop CM. The paradox of extreme high-altitude migration in bar-headed geese *Anser indicus. Proc Biol Sci* 280: 20122114, 2013. doi:10.1098/rspb.2012.2114.
- Hunter EA, Nibbelink NP, Cooper RJ. Threat predictability influences seaside sparrow nest site selection when facing trade-offs from predation and flooding. *Anim Behav* 120: 135–142, 2016. doi:10. 1016/j.anbehav.2016.08.001.
- Lill A, Fell PJ. Microclimate of nesting burrows of the rainbow bee-eater. *Emu* 107: 108–114, 2007. doi:10. 1071/MU06046.
- Ackerman R, Lott D. Thermal, hydric and respiratory climate of nests. In: *Reptillan Incubation: Environment*, *Evolution and Behaviour*, edited by Deeming DC. Nottingham, UK: Nottingham University Press, 2004, p. 15–43.
- Booth D. The effect of hypoxia on oxygen consumption of embryonic estuarine crocodiles (*Crocodylus porosus*). J Herpetol 34: 478–481, 2000. doi:10. 2307/1565377.
- Richards JG. Chapter 10. Metabolic and molecular responses of fish to hypoxia. In: *Fish Physiology*, edited by Richards JG, Farrell AP, Brauner CJ. London: Academic Press, 2009, p. 443–485.
- Podrabsky JE, Wilson NE. Hypoxia and anoxia tolerance in the annual killifish Austrofundulus limnaeus. Integr Comp Biol 56: 500–509, 2016. doi:10.1093/ icb/icw092.
- Giussani DA, Davidge ST. Developmental programming of cardiovascular disease by prenatal hypoxia. J Dev Orig Health Dis 4: 328–337, 2013. doi:10.1017/ S204017441300010X.
- Zhang L. Prenatal hypoxia and cardiac programming. J Soc Gynecol Investig 12: 2–13, 2005. doi:10. 1016/j.jsgi.2004.09.004.
- Mulder AL, Miedema A, De Mey JG, Giussani DA, Blanco CE. Sympathetic control of the cardiovascular response to acute hypoxemia in the chick embryo. *Am J Physiol Regul Integr Comp Physiol* 282: R1156– R1163, 2002. doi:10.1152/ajpregu.00634.2001.
- Postlethwait JH, Yan YL, Desvignes T, Allard C, Titus T, Le François NR, Detrich HW 3rd. Embryogenesis and early skeletogenesis in the Antarctic bullhead notothen, *Notothenia coriiceps. Dev Dyn* 245: 1066– 1080, 2016. doi:10.1002/dvdy.24437.
- Wood CM, Brix KV, De Boeck G, Bergman HL, Bianchini A, Bianchini LF, Maina JN, Johannsson OE, Kavembe GD, Papah MB, Letura KM, Ojoo RO. Mammalian metabolic rates in the hottest fish on earth. *Sci Rep* 6: 26990, 2016. doi:10.1038/ srep26990.
- Jensen B, Wang T, Christoffels VM, Moorman AF. Evolution and development of the building plan of the vertebrate heart. *Biochim Biophys Acta* 1833: 783–794, 2013. doi:10.1016/j.bbamcr.2012. 10.004.

- Giussani DA. The fetal brain sparing response to hypoxia: physiological mechanisms. J Physiol 594: 1215–1230, 2016. doi:10.1113/JP271099.
- Fisher DJ, Heymann MA, Rudolph AM. Fetal myocardial oxygen and carbohydrate consumption during acutely induced hypoxemia. *Am J Physiol Heart Circ Physiol* 242: H657–H661, 1982. doi:10.1152/ ajpheart.1982.242.4.H657.
- Yaffe H, Parer JT, Block BS, Llanos AJ. Cardiorespiratory responses to graded reductions of uterine blood flow in the sheep fetus. *J Dev Physiol* 9: 325–336, 1987.
- Akiyama R, Mitsubayashi H, Tazawa H, Burggren WW. Heart rate responses to altered ambient oxygen in early (days 3-9) chick embryos in the intact egg. J Comp Physiol B 169: 85–92, 1999. doi:10. 1007/s003600050197.
- Altimiras J, Phu L. Lack of physiological plasticity in the early chicken embryo exposed to acute hypoxia. J Exp Zool 286: 450–456, 2000. doi:10.1002/ (SICI)1097-010X(20000401)286:5<450::AID-JEZ2> 3.0.CO;2-Y.
- Crossley DA, Burggren WW, Altimiras J. Cardiovascular regulation during hypoxia in embryos of the domestic chicken Gallus gallus. Am J Physiol Regul Integr Comp Physiol 284: R219–R226, 2003. doi:10. 1152/ajpregu.00654.2001.
- Mortola JP, Wills K, Trippenbach T, Al Awam K. Interactive effects of temperature and hypoxia on heart rate and oxygen consumption of the 3-day old chicken embryo. Comp Biochem Physiol A Mol Integr Physiol 155: 301–308, 2010. doi:10.1016/j. cbpa.2009.11.003.
- Sharma SK, Lucitti JL, Nordman C, Tinney JP, Tobita K, Keller BB. Impact of hypoxia on early chick embryo growth and cardiovascular function. *Pediatr Res* 59: 116–120, 2006. doi:10.1203/01. pdr.0000191579.63339.90.
- Crossley DA, Altimiras J. Cardiovascular development in embryos of the American alligator *Alligator mississippiensis*: effects of chronic and acute hypoxia. *J Exp Biol* 208: 31–39, 2005. doi:10.1242/jeb.01355.
- Eme J, Altimiras J, Hicks JW, Crossley DA. Hypoxic alligator embryos: chronic hypoxia, catecholamine levels and autonomic responses of in ovo alligators. *Comp Biochem Physiol A Mol Integr Physiol* 160: 412–420, 2011. doi:10.1016/j.cbpa.2011.07.010.
- Eme J, Hicks JW, Crossley DA 2nd. Chronic hypoxic incubation blunts a cardiovascular reflex loop in embryonic American alligator (*Alligator mississippien*sis). J Comp Physiol B 181: 981–990, 2011. doi:10. 1007/s00360-011-0569-z.
- Tate KB, Rhen T, Eme J, Kohl ZF, Crossley J, Elsey RM, Crossley DA 2nd. Periods of cardiovascular susceptibility to hypoxia in embryonic American alligators (Alligator mississippiensis). Am J Physiol Regul Integr Comp Physiol 310: R1267–R1278, 2016. doi:10.1152/ajpregu.00320.2015.
- Eme J, Rhen T, Crossley DA 2nd. Adjustments in cholinergic, adrenergic and purinergic control of cardiovascular function in snapping turtle embryos (*Chelydra serpentina*) incubated in chronic hypoxia. *J Comp Physiol B* 184: 891–902, 2014. doi:10.1007/ s00360-014-0848-6.
- Eme J, Tate KB, Rhen T, Crossley DA 2nd. Cardiovascular responses to putative chemoreceptor stimulation of embryonic common snapping turtles (*Chelydra serpentina*) chronically incubated in hypoxia (10% O<sub>2</sub>). *Comp Biochem Physiol A Mol Integr Physiol* 259: 110977, 2021. doi:10.1016/j.cbpa.2021. 110977.
- Tate KB, Kohl ZF, Eme J, Rhen T, Crossley DA 2nd. Critical windows of cardiovascular susceptibility to developmental hypoxia in common snapping turtle (*Chelydra serpentina*) embryos. *Physiol Biochem Zool* 88: 103–115, 2015. doi:10.1086/677683.

- Du WG, Thompson MB, Shine R. Facultative cardiac responses to regional hypoxia in lizard embryos. *Comp Biochem Physiol A Mol Integr Physiol* 156: 491–494, 2010. doi:10.1016/j.cbpa.2010.04.005.
- Holeton GF. Respiratory and circulatory responses of rainbow trout larvae to carbon monoxide and to hypoxia. J Exp Biol 55: 683–694, 1971. doi:10.1242/ jeb.55.3.683.
- McDonald DG, McMahon BR. Respiratory development in Arctic char Salvelinus alpinus under conditions of normoxia and chronic hypoxia. Can J Zool 55: 1461–1467, 1977. doi:10.1139/z77-189.
- Wood CM, McMahon BR, McDonald DG. Oxygen exchange and vascular resistance in the totally perfused rainbow trout. *Am J Physiol Regul Integr Comp Physiol* 234: R201–R208, 1978. doi:10.1152/ ajpregu.1978.234.5.R201.
- Bagatto B. Ontogeny of cardiovascular control in zebrafish (*Danio rerio*): effects of developmental environment. *Comp Biochem Physiol A Mol Integr Physiol* 141: 391–400, 2005. doi:10.1016/j.cbpb.2005. 07.002.
- Steele SL, Ekker M, Perry SF. Interactive effects of development and hypoxia on catecholamine synthesis and cardiac function in zebrafish (*Danio rerio*). J Comp Physiol B 181: 527–538, 2011. doi:10. 1007/s00360-010-0544-0.
- Steele SL, Lo KH, Li VW, Cheng SH, Ekker M, Perry SF. Loss of M2 muscarinic receptor function inhibits development of hypoxic bradycardia and alters cardiac β-adrenergic sensitivity in larval zebrafish (Danio rerio). Am J Physiol Regul Integr Comp Physiol 297: R412–R420, 2009. doi:10.1152/ajpregu. 00036.2009.
- Philipsen S, Hardison RC. Evolution of hemoglobin loci and their regulatory elements. *Blood Cells Mol Dis* 70: 2–12, 2018. doi:10.1016/j.bcmd.2017.08.001.
- Bianchini K, Wright PA. Hypoxia delays hematopoiesis: retention of embryonic hemoglobin and erythrocytes in larval rainbow trout, Oncorhynchus mykiss, during chronic hypoxia exposure. J Exp Biol 216: 4415–4425, 2013. doi:10.1242/jeb.083337.
- Haron A, Ruzal M, Shinder D, Druyan S. Hypoxia during incubation and its effects on broiler's embryonic development. *Poult Sci* 100: 100951, 2021. doi:10.1016/j.psj.2020.12.048.
- Schwerte T, Überbacher D, Pelster B. Non-invasive imaging of blood cell concentration and blood distribution in hypoxic incubated zebrafish in vivo (*Danio rerio*). *J Exp Biol* 206: 1299–1307, 2003. doi:10.1242/ jeb.00249.
- Kam YC. Physiological effects of hypoxia on metabolism and growth of turtle embryos. *Respir Physiol* 92: 127–138, 1993. doi:10.1016/0034-5687 (93)90033-7.
- Warburton SJ, Hastings D, Wang T. Responses to chronic hypoxia in embryonic alligators. *J Exp Zool* 273: 44–50, 1995. doi:10.1002/jez.1402730106.
- Allison BJ, Brain KL, Niu Y, Kane AD, Herrera EA, Thakor AS, Botting KJ, Cross CM, Itani N, Skeffington KL, Beck C, Giussani DA. Fetal in vivo continuous cardiovascular function during chronic hypoxia. J Physiol 594: 1247–1264, 2016. doi:10.1113/ JP271091.
- Hansell JA, Richter HG, Camm EJ, Herrera EA, Blanco CE, Villamor E, Patey OV, Lock MC, Trafford AW, Galli GL, Giussani DA. Maternal melatonin: effective intervention against developmental programming of cardiovascular dysfunction in adult offspring of complicated pregnancy. *J Pineal Res* 72: e12766, 2022. doi:10.1111/jpi.12766.
- Yaqoob N, Schwerte T. Cardiovascular and respiratory developmental plasticity under oxygen depleted environment and in genetically hypoxic zebrafish (*Danio rerio*). Comp Biochem Physiol A Mol Integr Physiol 156: 475–484, 2010. doi:10. 1016/j.cbpa.2010.03.033.

### **REVIEW**

- Corona TB, Warburton SJ. Regional hypoxia elicits regional changes in chorioallantoic membrane vascular density in alligator but not chicken embryos. *Comp Biochem Physiol A Mol Integr Physiol* 125: 57–61, 2000. doi:10.1016/S1095-6433(99)00159-2.
- Burton GJ, Reshetnikova OS, Milovanov AP, Teleshova OV. Stereological evaluation of vascular adaptations in human placental villi to differing forms of hypoxic stress. *Placenta* 17: 49–55, 1996. doi:10.1016/s0143-4004(05)80643-5.
- 65. Nuzzo AM, Camm EJ, Sferruzzi-Perri AN, Ashmore TJ, Yung HW, Cindrova-Davies T, Spiroski AM, Sutherland MR, Logan A, Austin-Williams S, Burton GJ, Rolfo A, Todros T, Murphy MP, Giussani DA. Placental adaptation to early-onset hypoxic pregnancy and mitochondria-targeted antioxidant therapy in a rodent model. *Am J Pathol* 188: 2704–2716, 2018. doi:10.1016/j.ajpath.2018.07.027.
- Al-Ghazali W, Chita SK, Chapman MG, Allan LD. Evidence of redistribution of cardiac output in asymmetrical growth retardation. Br J Obstet Gynaecol 96: 697–704, 1989. doi:10.1111/j.1471-0528.1989.tb03285.x.
- Bauer R, Walter B, Hoppe A, Gaser E, Lampe V, Kauf E, Zwiener U. Body weight distribution and organ size in newborn swine (*Sus scrofa domestica*)—a study describing an animal model for asymmetrical intrauterine growth retardation. *Exp Toxicol Pathol* 50: 59–65, 1998. doi:10.1016/S0940-2993 (98)80071-7.
- Mulder AL, van Golde JC, Prinzen FW, Blanco CE. Cardiac output distribution in response to hypoxia in the chick embryo in the second half of the incubation time. J Physiol 508: 281–287, 1998. doi:10. 1111/j.1469-7793.1998.281br.x.
- Sartori MR, Kohl ZF, Taylor EW, Abe AS, Crossley DA 2nd. Blood flow distribution in embryonic common snapping turtles *Chelydra serpentina* (Reptilia; Chelonia) during acute hypoxia and *a*-adrenergic regulation. *Comp Biochem Physiol A Mol Integr Physiol* 238: 110575, 2019. doi:10.1016/j.cbpa.2019. 110575.
- Crossley DA 2nd, Ling R, Nelson D, Gillium T, Conner J, Hapgood J, Elsey RM, Eme J. Metabolic responses to chronic hypoxic incubation in embryonic American alligators (*Alligator mississippiensis*). *Comp Biochem Physiol A Mol Integr Physiol* 203: 77–82, 2017. doi:10.1016/j.cbpa.2016.08.017.
- Dzialowski EM, von Plettenberg D, Elmonoufy NA, Burggren WW. Chronic hypoxia alters the physiological and morphological trajectories of developing chicken embryos. Comp Biochem Physiol A Mol Integr Physiol 131: 713–724, 2002. doi:10.1016/ s1095-6433(02)00009-0.
- Itani N, Skeffington KL, Beck C, Giussani DA. Sildenafil therapy for fetal cardiovascular dysfunction during hypoxic development: studies in the chick embryo. *J Physiol* 595: 1563–1573, 2017. doi: 10.1113/JP273393.
- Lindgren I, Altimiras J. Chronic prenatal hypoxia sensitizes β-adrenoceptors in the embryonic heart but causes postnatal desensitization. *Am J Physiol Regul Integr Comp Physiol* 297: R258–R264, 2009. doi:10.1152/ajpregu.00167.2009.
- Lindgren I, Altimiras J. Sensitivity of organ growth to chronically low oxygen levels during incubation in Red Junglefowl and domesticated chicken breeds. *Poult Sci* 90: 126–135, 2011. doi:10.3382/ps.2010-00996.
- Miller SL, Green LR, Peebles DM, Hanson MA, Blanco CE. Effects of chronic hypoxia and protein malnutrition on growth in the developing chick. *Am J Obstet Gynecol* 186: 261–267, 2002. doi:10.1067/ mob.2002.119629.
- Owerkowicz T, Elsey RM, Hicks JW. Atmospheric oxygen level affects growth trajectory, cardiopulmonary allometry and metabolic rate in the American alligator (Alligator mississippiensis). J Exp Biol 212: 1237–1247, 2009. doi:10.1242/ieb.023945.

- Parker SL, Dimkovikj VH. Effects of regional hypoxia and incubation temperature on growth, differentiation, heart mass, and oxygen consumption in embryos of the leopard gecko (*Eublepharis macularius*). *Comp Biochem Physiol A Mol Integr Physiol* 227: 51–59, 2019. doi:10.1016/j.cbpa.2018.09.006.
- Rouwet EV, Tintu AN, Schellings MW, van Bilsen M, Lutgens E, Hofstra L, Slaaf DW, Ramsay G, Le Noble FA. Hypoxia induces aortic hypertrophic growth, left ventricular dysfunction, and sympathetic hyperinnervation of peripheral arteries in the chick embryo. *Circulation* 105: 2791-2796, 2002. doi:10.1161/01. cir.0000017497.47084.06.
- Ruijtenbeek K, De Mey JG, Blanco CE. The chicken embryo in developmental physiology of the cardiovascular system: a traditional model with new possibilities. *Am J Physiol Regul Integr Comp Physiol* 283: R549–R551, 2002. doi:10.1152/ajpregu.00107. 2002.
- Sahan U, Ipek A, Yilmaz-Dikmen B, Aydin C, Kederli E. Effect of oxygen supplementation in the hatcher at high altitude on the incubation results of broiler eggs laid at low altitude. *Br Poult Sci* 52: 388–394, 2011. doi:10.1080/00071668.2011.578122.
- Salinas CE, Blanco CE, Villena M, Camm EJ, Tuckett JD, Weerakkody RA, Kane AD, Shelley AM, Wooding FB, Quy M, Giussani DA. Cardiac and vascular disease prior to hatching in chick embryos incubated at high altitude. J Dev Orig Health Dis 1: 60–66, 2010. doi:10.1017/S2040174409990043.
- Tang W, Zhao B, Chen Y, Du W. Reduced egg shell permeability affects embryonic development and hatchling traits in *Lycodon rufozonatum* and *Pelodiscus sinensis*. *Integr Zool* 13: 58–69, 2018. doi:10.1111/1749-4877.12269.
- Villamor E, Kessels CG, Ruijtenbeek K, van Suylen RJ, Belik J, de Mey JG, Blanco CE. Chronic in ovo hypoxia decreases pulmonary arterial contractile reactivity and induces biventricular cardiac enlargement in the chicken embryo. *Am J Physiol Regul Integr Comp Physiol* 287: R642–R651, 2004. doi:10. 1152/ajpregu.00611.2003.
- Wei Z, Zhang H, Jia C, Ling Y, Gou X, Deng X, Wu C. Blood gas, hemoglobin, and growth of Tibetan chicken embryos incubated at high altitude. *Poult Sci* 86: 904–908, 2007. doi:10.1093/ps/86.5.904.
- Zoer B, Kessels L, Vereijken A, De Mey JG, Bruggeman V, Decuypere E, Blanco CE, Villamor E. Effects of prenatal hypoxia on pulmonary vascular reactivity in chickens prone to pulmonary hypertension. J Physiol Pharmacol 60: 119–130, 2009.
- Eme J, Crossley DA 2nd, Hicks JW. Role of the left aortic arch and blood flows in embryonic American alligator (*Alligator mississippiensis*). J Comp Physiol B 181: 391–401, 2011. doi:10.1007/ s00360-010-0494-6.
- Hanauske AR, Buchok JB, Pardue RL, Muggia VA, Von Hoff DD. Assessment of biological activity of linear alpha-transforming growth factor and monospecific antibodies to alpha-transforming growth factor and linear alpha-transforming growth factor. *Cancer Res* 46: 5567–5570, 1986.
- Brain KL, Allison BJ, Niu Y, Cross CM, Itani N, Kane AD, Herrera EA, Skeffington KL, Botting KJ, Giussani DA. Intervention against hypertension in the next generation programmed by developmental hypoxia. *PLoS Biol* 17: e2006552, 2019. doi:10.1371/ journal.pbio.2006552.
- Ciuhandu CS, Stevens ED, Wright PA. The effect of oxygen on the growth of *Oncorhynchus mykiss* embryos with and without a chorion. J Fish Biol 67: 1544–1551, 2005. doi:10.1111/j.1095-8649.2005.00856.x.
- Del Rio AM, Mukai GN, Martin BT, Johnson RC, Fangue NA, Israel JA, Todgham AE. Differential sensitivity to warming and hypoxia during development and long-term effects of developmental exposure in early life stage Chinook salmon. *Conserv Physiol* 9: coab054, 2021. doi:10.1093/conphys/coab054.

- Miller SC, Gillis TE, Wright PA. The ontogeny of regulatory control of the rainbow trout (*Oncorhynchus mykiss*) heart and how this is influenced by chronic hypoxia exposure. *J Exp Biol* 214: 2065–2072, 2011. doi:10.1242/jeb.054825.
- Miller SC, Reeb SE, Wright PA, Gillis TE. Oxygen concentration in the water boundary layer next to rainbow trout (*Oncorhynchus mykiss*) embryos is influenced by hypoxia exposure time, metabolic rate, and water flow. *Can J Fish Aquat Sci* 65: 2170– 2177, 2008. doi:10.1139/F08-123.
- Barrionuevo WR, Fernandes MN, Rocha O. Aerobic and anaerobic metabolism for the zebrafish, *Danio rerio*, reared under normoxic and hypoxic conditions and exposed to acute hypoxia during development. *Braz J Biol* 70: 425–434, 2010. doi:10.1590/ S1519-69842010000200027.
- Del Rio AM, Davis BE, Fangue NA, Todgham AE. Combined effects of warming and hypoxia on early life stage Chinook salmon physiology and development. *Conserv Physiol* 7: coy078, 2019. doi:10.1093/ conphys/coy078.
- Kajimura S, Aida K, Duan C. Insulin-like growth factor-binding protein-1 (IGFBP-1) mediates hypoxiainduced embryonic growth and developmental retardation. *Proc Natl Acad Sci USA* 102: 1240–1245, 2005. doi:10.1073/pnas.0407443102.
- Mueller CA, Seymour RS. The regulation index: a new method for assessing the relationship between oxygen consumption and environmental oxygen. *Physiol Biochem Zool* 84: 522–532, 2011. doi:10. 1086/661953.
- Musa SM, Ripley DM, Moritz T, Shiels HA. Ocean warming and hypoxia affect embryonic growth, fitness and survival of small-spotted catsharks, *Scyliorhinus canicula*. J Fish Biol 97: 257–264, 2020. doi:10.1111/jfb.14370.
- Sun CF, Tao Y, Jiang XY, Zou SM. IGF binding protein 1 is correlated with hypoxia-induced growth reduce and developmental defects in grass carp (*Ctenopharyngodon idellus*) embryos. *Gen Comp Endocrinol* 172: 409–415, 2011. doi:10.1016/j.ygcen. 2011.04.005.
- Wood AT, Andrewartha SJ, Elliott NG, Frappell PB, Clark TD. Hypoxia during incubation does not affect aerobic performance or haematology of Atlantic salmon (Salmo salar) when re-exposed in later life. Conserv Physiol 7: coz088, 2019. doi:10.1093/ conphys/coz088.
- El-Fiky N, Wieser W. Life styles and patterns of development of gills and muscles in larval cyprinids (Cyprinidae; Teleostei). J Fish Biol 33: 135-145, 1988. doi:10.1111/j.1095-8649.1988.tb05455.x.
- Giussani DA, Riquelme RA, Moraga FA, McGarrigle HH, Gaete CR, Sanhueza EM, Hanson MA, Llanos AJ. Chemoreflex and endocrine components of cardiovascular responses to acute hypoxemia in the llama fetus. *Am J Physiol Regul Integr Comp Physiol* 271: R73–R83, 1996. doi:10.1152/ajpregu.1996.271.1. R73.
- 102. Llanos AJ, Riquelme RA, Sanhueza EM, Hanson MA, Blanco CE, Parer JT, Herrera EA, Pulgar VM, Reyes RV, Cabello G, Giussani DA. The fetal llama versus the fetal sheep: different strategies to withstand hypoxia. *High Alt Med Biol* 4: 193–202, 2003. doi:10.1089/152702903322022794.
- Reichel CM, See RE. Chronic modafinil effects on drug-seeking following methamphetamine selfadministration in rats. *Int J Neuropsychopharmacol* 15: 919–929, 2012. doi:10.1017/S1461145711000988.
- Kitanaka T, Alonso JG, Gilbert RD, Siu BL, Clemons GK, Longo LD. Fetal responses to long-term hypoxemia in sheep. Am J Physiol Regul Integr Comp Physiol 256: R1348–R1354, 1989. doi:10.1152/ajpregu. 1989.256.6.R1348.
- 105. Evans LC, Liu H, Pinkas GA, Thompson LP. Chronic hypoxia increases peroxynitrite, MMP9 expression, and collagen accumulation in fetal guinea pig hearts. *Pediatr Res* 71: 25–31, 2012. doi:10.1038/pr.2011.10.

- 106. Rueda-Clausen CF, Morton JS, Dolinsky VW, Dyck JR, Davidge ST. Synergistic effects of prenatal hypoxia and postnatal high-fat diet in the development of cardiovascular pathology in young rats. *Am J Physiol Regul Integr Comp Physiol* 303: R418–R426, 2012. doi:10.1152/ajpregu.00148.2012.
- Herrera EA, Salinas C, Blanco C, Villena M, Giussani DA. High altitude hypoxia and blood pressure dysregulation in adult chickens. *J Dev Orig Health Dis* 4: 69–76, 2013. doi:10.1017/S204017441200058X.
- Tong W, Xue Q, Li Y, Zhang L. Maternal hypoxia alters matrix metalloproteinase expression patterns and causes cardiac remodeling in fetal and neonatal rats. *Am J Physiol Heart Circ Physiol* 301: H213– H2121, 2011. doi:10.1152/ajpheart.00356.2011.
- 109. Xu Y, Williams SJ, O'Brien D, Davidge ST. Hypoxia or nutrient restriction during pregnancy in rats leads to progressive cardiac remodeling and impairs postischemic recovery in adult male offspring. *FASEB J* 20: 1251–1253, 2006. doi:10.1096/fj.05-4917fje.
- Chan T, Burggren W. Hypoxic incubation creates differential morphological effects during specific developmental critical windows in the embryo of the chicken (*Gallus gallus*). *Respir Physiol Neurobiol* 145: 251–263, 2005. doi:10.1016/j.resp.2004.09. 005.
- Asson-Batres MA, Stock MK, Hare JF, Metcalfe J. O<sub>2</sub> effect on composition of chick embryonic heart and brain. *Respir Physiol* 77: 101–109, 1989. doi:10. 1016/0034-5687(89)90033-9.
- Stock MK, Metcalfe J. Modulation of growth and metabolism of the chick embryo by a brief (72-hr) change in oxygen availability. J Exp Zool Suppl 1: 351–356, 1987.
- 113. Cypher AD, Fetterman B, Bagatto B. Vascular parameters continue to decrease post-exposure with simultaneous, but not individual exposure to BPA and hypoxia in zebrafish larvae. *Comp Biochem Physiol C Toxicol Pharmacol* 206–207: 11–16, 2018. doi:10.1016/j.cbpc.2018.02.002.
- Jacob E, Drexel M, Schwerte T, Pelster B. Influence of hypoxia and of hypoxemia on the development of cardiac activity in zebrafish larvae. *Am J Physiol Regul Integr Comp Physiol* 283: R911–R917, 2002. doi:10.1152/ajpregu.00673.2001.
- Moore FB, Hosey M, Bagatto B. Cardiovascular system in larval zebrafish responds to developmental hypoxia in a family specific manner. *Front Zool* 3: 4, 2006. doi:10.1186/1742-9994-3-4.
- Fletcher AJ, Gardner DS, Edwards CM, Fowden AL, Giussani DA. Development of the ovine fetal cardiovascular defense to hypoxemia towards full term. *Am J Physiol Heart Circ Physiol* 291: H3023–H3034, 2006. doi:10.1152/ajpheart.00504.2006.
- 117. Gardner DS, Fletcher AJ, Bloomfield MR, Fowden AL, Giussani DA. Effects of prevailing hypoxaemia, acidaemia or hypoglycaemia upon the cardiovascular, endocrine and metabolic responses to acute hypoxaemia in the ovine fetus. *J Physiol* 540: 351–366, 2002. doi:10.1113/jphysiol.2001.013434.
- Jones CT, Roebuck MM, Walker DW, Johnston BM. The role of the adrenal medulla and peripheral sympathetic nerves in the physiological responses of the fetal sheep to hypoxia. J Dev Physiol 10: 17–36, 1988.
- 119. Simonetta G, Rourke AK, Owens JA, Robinson JS, McMillen IC. Impact of placental restriction on the development of the sympathoadrenal system. *Pediatr Res* 42: 805–811, 1997. doi:10.1203/00006450-199712000-00015.
- 120. Lindgren I, Crossley D 2nd, Villamor E, Altimiras J. Hypotension in the chronically hypoxic chicken embryo is related to the β-adrenergic response of chorioallantoic and femoral arteries and not to bradycardia. *Am J Physiol Regul Integr Comp Physiol* 301: R1161–R1168, 2011. doi:10.1152/ajpregu.00458.2010.

- Mulder AL, Golde JM, Goor AA, Giussani DA, Blanco CE. Developmental changes in plasma catecholamine concentrations during normoxia and acute hypoxia in the chick embryo. *J Physiol* 527: 593– 599, 2000. doi:10.1111/j.1469-7793.2000.00593.x.
- Ruijtenbeek K, Le Noble F, Janssen G, Kessels C, Fazzi G, Blanco C, De Mey J. Chronic hypoxia stimulates periarterial sympathetic nerve development in chicken embryo. *Circulation* 102: 2892–2897, 2000. doi:10.1161/01.cir.102.23.2892.
- 123. Lindgren I, Altimiras J. Prenatal hypoxia programs changes in β-adrenergic signaling and postnatal cardiac contractile dysfunction. *Am J Physiol Regul Integr Comp Physiol* 305: R1093–R1101, 2013. doi:10. 1152/ajpregu.00320.2013.
- Lopaschuk GD, Jaswal JS. Energy metabolic phenotype of the cardiomyocyte during development, differentiation, and postnatal maturation. J Cardiovasc Pharmacol 56: 130–140, 2010. doi:10.1097/FJC. Ob013e3181e74a14.
- 125. Murray AJ, Horscroft JA. Mitochondrial function at extreme high altitude. *J Physiol* 594: 1137–1149, 2016. doi:10.1113/JP270079.
- Al-Hasan YM, Evans LC, Pinkas GA, Dabkowski ER, Stanley WC, Thompson LP. Chronic hypoxia impairs cytochrome oxidase activity via oxidative stress in selected fetal Guinea pig organs. *Reprod Sci* 20: 299–307, 2013. doi:10.1177/1933719112453509.
- 127. Smith KM, Swiderska A, Lock MC, Graham L, Iswari W, Choudhary T, Thomas D, Kowash H, Desforges M, Cottrell EC, Trafford AW, Giussani DA, Galli GL. Chronic developmental hypoxia alters mitochondrial oxidative capacity and reactive oxygen species production in the fetal rat heart in a sex-dependent manner. *J Pineal Res* 73: e12821, 2022. doi:10.1111/jpi.12821.
- 128. Song H, Polster BM, Thompson LP. Chronic hypoxia alters cardiac mitochondrial complex protein expression and activity in fetal guinea pigs in a sex-selective manner. Am J Physiol Regul Integr Comp Physiol 321: R912–R924, 2021. doi:10.1152/ajpregu.00004.2021.
- Starr VJ, Dzialowski EM. Developing chicken cardiac muscle mitochondria are resistant to variations in incubation oxygen levels. *Curr Res Physiol* 5: 151– 157, 2022. doi:10.1016/j.crphys.2022.03.001.
- Botting KJ, Skeffington KL, Niu Y, Allison BJ, Brain KL, Itani N, Beck C, Logan A, Murray AJ, Murphy MP, Giussani DA. Translatable mitochondria-targeted protection against programmed cardiovascular dysfunction. *Sci Adv* 6: eabb1929, 2020. doi:10.1126/ sciadv.abb1929.
- 131. Galli GL, Crossley J, Elsey RM, Działowski EM, Shiels HA, Crossley DA 2nd. Developmental plasticity of mitochondrial function in American alligators, *Alligator mississippiensis*. Am J Physiol Regul Integr Comp. Physiol 311: R1164–R1172, 2016. doi:10.1152/ ajpregu.00107.2016.
- 132. Barker D. The fetal origins of diseases of old age. *Eur J Clin Nutr* 46, Suppl 3: S3–S9, 1992.
- 133. Mamun AA, O'Callaghan MJ, Williams GM, Najman JM. Maternal smoking during pregnancy predicts adult offspring cardiovascular risk factors—evidence from a community-based large birth cohort study. *PLoS One* 7: e41106, 2012. doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0041106.
- Thornburg KL, O'Tierney PF, Louey S. Review: the placenta is a programming agent for cardiovascular disease. *Placenta* 31: S54–S59, 2010. doi:10.1016/j. placenta.2010.01.002.
- Wang AM, Karumanchi SA. Offspring cardiovascular disease in preeclampsia. *Hypertension* 69: 589–590, 2017. doi:10.1161/HYPERTENSIONAHA.117.08957.
- Wojczakowski W, Kimber-Trojnar Ż, Dziwisz F, Słodzińska M, Słodziński H, Leszczyńska-Gorzelak B. Preeclampsia and cardiovascular risk for offspring. *J Clin Med* 10: 3154, 2021. doi:10.3390/jcm10143154.
- Boersma B, Wit JM. Catch-up growth. Endocr Rev 18: 646–661, 1997. doi:10.1210/edrv.18.5.0313.

- 138. Claris O, Beltrand J, Levy-Marchal C. Consequences of intrauterine growth and early neonatal catchup growth. *Semin Perinatol* 34: 207–210, 2010. doi:10.1053/j.semperi.2010.02.005.
- Rueda-Clausen CF, Morton JS, Lopaschuk GD, Davidge ST. Long-term effects of intrauterine growth restriction on cardiac metabolism and susceptibility to ischaemia/reperfusion. *Cardiovasc Res* 90: 285–294, 2011. doi:10.1093/cvr/cvq363.
- 140. Xue Q, Zhang L. Prenatal hypoxia causes a sexdependent increase in heart susceptibility to ischemia and reperfusion injury in adult male offspring: role of protein kinase C epsilon. J Pharmacol Exp Ther 330: 624–632, 2009. doi:10. 1124/jpet.109.153239.
- 141. Yang Q, Hohimer AR, Giraud GD, Van Winkle DM, Underwood MJ, He GW, Davis LE. Effect of fetal anaemia on myocardial ischaemia-reperfusion injury and coronary vasoreactivity in adult sheep. *Acta Physiol (Oxf)* 194: 325–334, 2008. doi:10.1111/ j.1748-1716.2008.01892.x.
- 142. Salinas CE, Blanco CE, Villena M, Giussani DA. High-altitude hypoxia and echocardiographic indices of pulmonary hypertension in male and female chickens at adulthood. *Circ J* 78: 1459–1464, 2014. doi:10.1253/circj.cj-13-1329.
- 143. Tintu A, Rouwet E, Verlohren S, Brinkmann J, Ahmad S, Crispi F, van Bilsen M, Carmeliet P, Staff AC, Tjwa M, Cetin I, Gratacos E, Hernandez-Andrade E, Hofstra L, Jacobs M, Lamers WH, Morano I, Safak E, Ahmed A, Le Noble F. Hypoxia induces dilated cardiomyopathy in the chick embryo: mechanism, intervention, and long-term consequences. *PLoS One* 4: e5155, 2009. doi:10.1371/journal. pone.0005155.
- 144. Joyce W, Miller TE, Elsey RM, Wang T, Crossley DA 2nd. The effects of embryonic hypoxic programming on cardiovascular function and autonomic regulation in the American alligator (Alligator mississippiensis) at rest and during swimming. J Comp Physiol B 188: 967–976, 2018. doi:10.1007/s00360-018-1181-2.
- 145. Smith B, Crossley JL, Elsey RM, Hicks JW, Crossley DA 2nd. Embryonic developmental oxygen preconditions cardiovascular functional response to acute hypoxic exposure and maximal β-adrenergic stimulation of anesthetized juvenile American alligators (*Alligator mississippiensis*). J Exp Biol 222: jeb205419, 2019. doi:10.1242/jeb.205419.
- 146. Wearing OH, Eme J, Rhen T, Crossley DA 2nd. Phenotypic plasticity in the common snapping turtle (Chelydra serpentina): long-term physiological effects of chronic hypoxia during embryonic development. Am J Physiol Regul Integr Comp Physiol 310: R176–R184, 2016. doi:10.1152/ ajpregu.00293.2015.
- 147. Ding H, Luo Y, Hu K, Huang H, Liu P, Xiong M, Zhu L, Yi J, Xu Y. Hypoxia in utero increases the risk of pulmonary hypertension in rat offspring and is associated with vasopressin type-2 receptor upregulation. *Mol Med Rep* 22: 4173–4182, 2020. doi:10. 3892/mmr.2020.11533.
- 148. Rabinovitch M, Gamble W, Nadas AS, Miettinen OS, Reid L. Rat pulmonary circulation after chronic hypoxia: hemodynamic and structural features. *Am J Physiol Heart Circ Physiol* 236: H818–H827, 1979. doi:10.1152/ajpheart.1979.236.6.H818.
- 149. Wearing OH, Conner J, Nelson D, Crossley J, Crossley DA 2nd. Embryonic hypoxia programmes postprandial cardiovascular function in adult common snapping turtles (*Chelydra serpentina*). J Exp Biol 220: 2589–2597, 2017. doi:10.1242/jeb.160549.
- 150. Ruhr I, Bierstedt J, Rhen T, Das D, Singh SK, Miller S, Crossley DA, Galli GL. Developmental programming of DNA methylation and gene expression patterns is associated with extreme cardiovascular tolerance to anoxia in the common snapping turtle. *Epigenetics Chromatin* 14: 42, 2021. doi:10. 1186/s13072-021-00414-7.

### **REVIEW**

- Ruhr IM, McCourty H, Bajjig A, Crossley DA 2nd, Shiels HA, Galli GL. Developmental plasticity of cardiac anoxia-tolerance in juvenile common snapping turtles (*Chelydra serpentina*). *Proc Biol Sci* 286: 20191072, 2019. doi:10.1098/rspb.2019. 1072.
- 152. Galli GL, Ruhr IM, Crossley J, Crossley DA 2nd. The long-term effects of developmental hypoxia on cardiac mitochondrial function in snapping turtles. *Front Physiol* 12: 689684, 2021. doi:10.3389/fphys. 2021.689684.
- Cadiz L, Servili A, Quazuguel P, Madec L, Zambonino-Infante JL, Mazurais D. Early exposure to chronic hypoxia induces short- and long-term regulation of hemoglobin gene expression in European sea bass (*Dicentrarchus labrax*). J Exp Biol 220: 3119–3126, 2017. doi:10.1242/jeb.160713.
- Johnston EF, Alderman SL, Gillis TE. Chronic hypoxia exposure of trout embryos alters swimming performance and cardiac gene expression in larvae. *Physiol Biochem Zool* 86: 567–575, 2013. doi:10. 1086/672012.
- 155. Vanderplancke G, Claireaux G, Quazuguel P, Madec L, Ferraresso S, Sévère A, Zambonino-Infante JL, Mazurais D. Hypoxic episode during the larval period has long-term effects on European sea bass juveniles (*Dicentrarchus labrax*). Mar Biol 162: 367–376, 2015. doi:10.1007/s00227-014-2601-9.
- 156. Wood AT, Clark TD, Andrewartha SJ, Elliott NG, Frappell PB. Developmental hypoxia has negligible effects on long-term hypoxia tolerance and aerobic metabolism of Atlantic salmon (Salmo salar). *Physiol Biochem Zool* 90: 494–501, 2017. doi:10.1086/692250.